## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF GEORGIA MACON DIVISION

JOSHUA HUMPHREY, :

:

Plaintiff,

.

VS.

•

Warden FREDERICK HEAD, : NO. 5:15-CV-73-MTT

MARLON GRIFFITH,

:

Defendants.

ORDER & RECOMMENDATION

Pro se Plaintiff **JOSHUA HUMPHREY**, an inmate at Jenkins Corrections Center in Millen, Georgia, has filed a 42 U.S.C. § 1983 complaint (Doc. 1) and a motion to proceed *in forma pauperis* (Doc. 2).

Based on his submissions, the Court finds Plaintiff is unable to prepay the filing fee. Accordingly, the Court **GRANTS** his motion to proceed *in forma pauperis* and waives the initial partial filing fee pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1915(b)(1). Plaintiff is nevertheless obligated to pay the \$350.00 filing fee, as is discussed below. The Clerk of Court is directed to send a copy of this Order to the business manager at Plaintiff's place of incarceration.

#### I. STANDARD OF REVIEW

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1915A(a), a federal court is required to conduct an initial

screening of a prisoner complaint which "seeks redress from a governmental entity or officer or employee of a governmental entity." Section 1915A(b) requires a federal court to dismiss a prisoner complaint that is: (1) "frivolous, malicious, or fails to state a claim upon which relief may be granted"; or (2) "seeks monetary relief from a defendant who is immune from such relief."

A claim is frivolous when it appears from the face of the complaint that the factual allegations are "clearly baseless" or that the legal theories are "indisputably meritless." *Carroll v. Gross*, 984 F.2d 392, 393 (11th Cir. 1993). A complaint fails to state a claim when it does not include "enough factual matter (taken as true)" to "give the defendant fair notice of what the . . . claim is and the grounds upon which it rests[.]" *Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly*, 550 U.S. 544, 555-56 (2007) (noting that "[f]actual allegations must be enough to raise a right to relief above the speculative level," and that the complaint "must contain something more . . . than ... a statement of facts that merely creates a suspicion [of] a legally cognizable right of action") (internal quotations and citations omitted); *see also Ashcroft v. Iqbal*, 556 U.S. 662, 678 (2009) (explaining that "threadbare recitals of the elements of a cause of action, supported by mere conclusory statements, do not suffice").

In making the above determinations, all factual allegations in the complaint must be viewed as true. *Brown v. Johnson*, 387 F.3d 1344, 1347 (11th Cir. 2004). Moreover, "[p]ro se pleadings are held to a less stringent standard than pleadings drafted

by attorneys and will, therefore, be liberally construed." *Tannenbaum v. United States*, 148 F.3d 1262, 1263 (11th Cir. 1998).

In order to state a claim for relief under § 1983, a plaintiff must allege that: (1) an act or omission deprived him of a right, privilege, or immunity secured by the Constitution or a statute of the United States; and (2) the act or omission was committed by a person acting under color of state law. *Hale v. Tallapoosa County*, 50 F.3d 1579, 1581 (11th Cir. 1995). If a litigant cannot satisfy these requirements, or fails to provide factual allegations to support his claim or claims, then the complaint is subject to dismissal. *See Chappell v. Rich*, 340 F.3d 1279, 1282-84 (11th Cir. 2003) (affirming the district court's dismissal of a § 1983 complaint because the plaintiffs factual allegations were insufficient to support the alleged constitutional violation). *See also* 28 U.S.C. § 1915A(b) (dictating that a complaint, or any portion thereof, that does not pass the standard in section 1915A "shall" be dismissed on preliminary review).

#### II. ANALYSIS

Plaintiff alleges he "received a tip" that Lieutenant Griffith called him a snitch and, as a result, he feared for his life. When he asked Defendant Griffith to move him to a different building for safety reasons, Griffith responded that he did "not negotiate with terrorist[s]." (Doc. 1 at 5). Instead of moving him to a different building, Griffith ordered that he be placed in "the SHU." (Doc. 1 at 5). Plaintiff, a Muslim, claims Griffith placed him in the SHU as "a form of religious discrimination and excessive

harassment." (Doc. 1 at 5). Plaintiff alleges he has suffered "continuous harassment" from unnamed correctional officers since being placed in the SHU. Plaintiff states that "Warden Head was alerted to this situation and refused to do anything about it." (Doc. 1 at 5).

Construing Plaintiff's complaint liberally, he makes a claim of disparate treatment. "To establish an equal protection claim, a prisoner must demonstrate that (1) 'he is similarly situated with other prisoners who received' more favorable treatment; and (2) his discriminatory treatment was based on some constitutionally protected interest such as race," religion, or gender. *Jones v. Ray*, 279 F.3d 944, 946-47 (11th Cir. 2001) (quoting *Damiano v. Fla. Parole & Prob. Comm'n*, 785 F.2d 929, 932-33 (11th Cir. 1986)). Plaintiff claims he is treated differently because he is a Muslim and alleges "the existence of purposeful discrimination." *McClesky v. Kemp*, 481 U.S. 279, 292 (1987) (quoting *Whitus v. Georgia*, 385 U.S. 545, 550 (1967). Specifically, he claims Griffith knows he is a Muslim and "acted with a discriminatory purpose" when he harassed him and placed him in the "SHU." *Id.* Plaintiff has alleged a sufficient factual basis to allow this claim to go forward against Defendant Griffith.

Plaintiff does not claim Warden Head has harassed or discriminated against him because of his religion. Instead, he just states that "Warden Head was alerted to the situation and refused to do anything about it." (Doc. 1 at 5). A supervisory official, such as Warden Head, is not liable under § 1983 solely on the basis of respondent superior or

vicarious liability. *Brown v. Crawford*, 906 F.2d 667, 671 (11th Cir. 1990). Instead, there must be an affirmative link between the defendant's action and the alleged constitutional deprivation. *Gilmere v. Atlanta*, 774 F.2d 1495, 1504 (11th Cir. 1985). A plaintiff must show one of the following: (1) personal participation; (2) "a history of widespread abuse [that] puts the responsible supervisor on notice of the need to correct the alleged deprivation, and he fails to do so"; (3)"a supervisor's custom or policy [that] results in deliberate indifference to constitutional rights"; or (4) the "facts support an inference that the supervisor directed the subordinates to act unlawfully or knew that the subordinates would act unlawfully and failed to stop them from doing so." *Cottone v. Jenne*, 326 F.3d 1352, 1360 (11th Cir. 2003) (internal citations and quotations omitted). Plaintiff has not made any such showing.

For this reason, it is **RECOMMENDED** that Warden Head be **DISMISSED** from this action.

In summary, Plaintiff's claim against Defendant Griffith shall be allowed to go forward. It is **ORDERED** that service be made on Defendant Griffith and he file an Answer, or such other response as may be appropriate under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, 28 U.S.C. § 1915, and the Prison Litigation Reform Act. Defendant is also reminded of the duty to avoid unnecessary service expenses, and of the possible imposition of expenses for failure to waive service pursuant to Rule 4(d).

It is **RECOMMENDED** that Defendant Head be **DISMISSED** from this action.

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1), the parties may serve and file written objections to this Recommendation, or seek an extension of time to file objections, WITHIN FOURTEEN (14) DAYS after being served with a copy thereof. The District Judge shall make a de novo determination as to those portions of the Recommendation to which objection is made; all other portions of the Recommendation may be reviewed by the District Judge for clear error.

The parties are hereby notified that, pursuant to Eleventh Circuit Rule 3-1, "[a] party failing to object to a magistrate judge's findings or recommendations contained in a report and recommendation in accordance with the provisions of 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1) waives the right to challenge on appeal the district court's order based on unobjected-to factual and legal conclusions if the party was informed of the time period for objecting and the consequences on appeal for failing to object. In the absence of a proper objection, however, the court may review on appeal for plain error if necessary in the interests of justice."

#### DUTY TO ADVISE OF ADDRESS CHANGE

During the pendency of this action, all parties shall at all times keep the Clerk of this Court and all opposing attorneys and/or parties advised of their current address. Failure to promptly advise the Clerk of any change of address may result in the dismissal of a party's pleadings.

#### **DUTY TO PROSECUTE ACTION**

Plaintiff must diligently prosecute his complaint or face the possibility that it will be dismissed under Rule 41(b) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure for failure to prosecute. Defendants are advised that they are expected to diligently defend all allegations made against them and to file timely dispositive motions as hereinafter directed. This matter will be set down for trial when the Court determines that discovery has been completed and that all motions have been disposed of or the time for filing dispositive motions has passed.

# FILING AND SERVICE OF MOTIONS, PLEADINGS, DISCOVERY AND CORRESPONDENCE

It is the responsibility of each party to file original motions, pleadings, and correspondence with the Clerk of Court. A party need not serve the opposing party by mail if the opposing party is represented by counsel. In such cases, any motions, pleadings, or correspondence shall be served electronically at the time of filing with the Court. If any party is not represented by counsel, however, it is the responsibility of each opposing party to serve copies of all motions, pleadings, and correspondence upon the unrepresented party and to attach to said original motions, pleadings, and correspondence filed with the Clerk of Court a certificate of service indicating who has been served and where (i.e., at what address), when service was made, and how service was accomplished (i.e., by U.S. Mail, by personal service, etc.).

### **DISCOVERY**

Plaintiff shall not commence discovery until an answer or dispositive motion has been filed on behalf of the defendants from whom discovery is sought by the plaintiff. The Defendants shall not commence discovery until such time as an answer or dispositive motion has been filed. Once an answer or dispositive motion has been filed, the parties are authorized to seek discovery from one another as provided in the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The deposition of the Plaintiff, a state/county prisoner, may be taken at any time during the time period hereinafter set out provided prior arrangements are made with his custodian. Plaintiff is hereby advised that failure to submit to a deposition may result in the dismissal of his lawsuit under Rule 37 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that discovery (including depositions and the service of written discovery requests) shall be completed within 90 days of the date of filing of an answer or dispositive motion by the defendant (whichever comes first) unless an extension is otherwise granted by the court upon a showing of good cause therefor or a protective order is sought by the defendants and granted by the court. This 90-day period shall run separately as to Plaintiff and each Defendant beginning on the date of filing of each Defendant's answer or dispositive motion (whichever comes first). The scheduling of a trial may be advanced upon notification from the parties that no further discovery is contemplated or that discovery has been completed prior to the deadline.

Discovery materials shall <u>not</u> be filed with the Clerk of Court. No party shall be required to respond to any discovery not directed to him/her or served upon him/her by the opposing counsel/party. The undersigned incorporates herein those parts of the Local Rules imposing the following limitations on discovery: except with written permission of the court first obtained, **INTERROGATORIES** may not exceed TWENTY-FIVE (25) to each party, **REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS AND THINGS** under Rule 34 of the FEDERAL RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE may not exceed TEN (10) requests to each party, and **REQUESTS FOR ADMISSIONS** under Rule 36 of the FEDERAL RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE may not exceed FIFTEEN (15) requests to each party. No party shall be required to respond to any such requests which exceed these limitations.

## REQUESTS FOR DISMISSAL AND/OR JUDGMENT

The Court shall not consider requests for dismissal of or judgment in this action, absent the filing of a motion therefor accompanied by a brief/memorandum of law citing supporting authorities. Dispositive motions should be filed at the earliest time possible, but in any event no later than one hundred-twenty (120) days from when the discovery period begins, unless otherwise directed.

## **DIRECTIONS TO CUSTODIAN OF PLAINTIFF**

In accordance with the *Prison Litigation Reform Act*, Plaintiff's custodian is hereby directed to remit to the Clerk of this Court each month twenty percent (20%) of the

preceding month's income credited to Plaintiff's inmate account until the \$350.00 filing

fee has been paid in full, provided the amount in the account exceeds \$10.00. Transfers

from Plaintiff's account shall continue until the entire filing fee has been collected,

notwithstanding the earlier dismissal of Plaintiff's lawsuit.

PLAINTIFF'S OBLIGATION TO PAY FILING FEE

If Plaintiff is hereafter released from custody, he shall remain obligated to pay any

remaining balance due of the above filing fee; Plaintiff shall continue to remit monthly

payments as required by the Prison Litigation Reform Act. Collection from Plaintiff of

any balance due by any means permitted by law is hereby authorized in the event Plaintiff

fails to remit payments.

**SO ORDERED**, this 27th day of March, 2015.

s/ Charles H. Weigle

Charles H. Weigle

United States Magistrate Judge

10